

Members

Katie Pratt, *Chair*
Jonah Jensen, *Vice-Chair*
Brittani Flowers
Roger Johnson
Lysa Schloesser
James Steel
Eugene Thorne
Jeff Williams
Kevin Bartoy
Ken House



MINUTES

Landmarks Preservation Commission Planning and Development Services Department

Marshall McClintock, North Slope Ex-Officio

Staff

Reuben McKnight, Historic Preservation Officer
Lauren Hoogkamer, Historic Preservation Coordinator
John Griffith, Office Assistant

Date: May 24, 2017

Location: 747 Market Street, Tacoma Municipal Building, Room 248

Commission Members in Attendance:

Katie Pratt, *Chair*
Brittani Flowers
Roger Johnson
Lysa Schloesser
Eugene Thorne
Jeff Williams
Ken House
Marshall McClintock

Staff Present:

Lauren Hoogkamer
John Griffith

Others Present:

Carol Goforth
Eckhart Klee
Kathy Ursich
Jason Lamb
Kimberly Shoemake-Medlock
Dave Bonewitz
Mike Bartlett
Michael Sullivan

Commission Members Absent:

Jonah Jensen, *Vice-Chair*
James Steel
Kevin Bartoy

Chair Katie Pratt called the meeting to order at 5:35 p.m.

1. ROLL CALL

2. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. Excusal of Absences
- B. Approval of Minutes: 4/26/17
- C. Administrative Review
 - 4604 N 38th Street—roof/gutters
 - 1021 N 12th Street—fireplace vent cover
 - 520 N Cushman Avenue—AC unit
 - 616 N Ainsworth Avenue—AC unit

The consent agenda was approved.

3. TACOMA REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES—PRELIMINARY REVIEW

- A. 2312 North 29th Street

Ms. Hoogkamer read the staff report.

BACKGROUND

The house, at 2312 North 29th Street, is built in the National Folk style, a vernacular style popular from about 1850 until 1930. Although, the exact build date is unknown, the house appears on maps starting in 1884. It served as working-class housing during the early development Old Town. Significant dates include 1884-1916, when it was occupied by Croatian tenants. The building is nominated under Criterion A as a remaining territorial residence from the earliest period of Old Town's development and its Croatian community; Criterion B for its association with Janet

E. Steele, who built the first lumber building in Tacoma as well as gave birth to the first two European American children in Tacoma. It is also associated with John N. Fuller, who served as a member of the city council of Old Tacoma and of the consolidated city council of Old and New Tacoma. The nomination also includes Criterion E as this house sits within the same city block as Seamen's Rest (2802 N. Carr), within one block of the Slavonian Hall (2306 N. 30th) and two blocks from St. Peters Episcopal Church (2910 N. Starr), all listed city landmarks.

The property is nominated under the following criteria:

- A. *Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or*
- B. *Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or*
- C. *Is part of, adjacent to, or related to an existing or proposed historic district, square, park, or other distinctive area which should be redeveloped or preserved according to a plan based on a historic, cultural, or architectural motif*

REQUESTED ACTION

Determination of whether the property nominated to the Tacoma Register of Historic Places appears to meet the threshold criteria for nomination, and if so, scheduling the nominations for public hearing. The commission may forward all or part of the nomination for future consideration.

EFFECTS OF NOMINATION

- Future changes to the exterior will require approval of the Landmarks Preservation Commission prior to those changes being made, to ensure historical and architectural appropriateness.
- Unnecessary demolition of properties listed on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places is strongly discouraged by the municipal code, and requires approval of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.
- Future renovations of listed on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places may qualify for the Special Tax Valuation property tax incentive.
- The property will become eligible for the Historic Conditional Use Permit.

STANDARDS

The threshold criteria for Tacoma Register listing are listed at 13.07.040B(1), and include:

1. Property is at least 50 years old at the time of nomination; and,
2. The property retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association such that it is able to convey its historical, cultural, or architectural significance.

ANALYSIS

1. At over 133-years-old the property meets the age threshold criterion.
2. The property retains its integrity, including its original massing, scale, feeling, and most materials; the front façade is intact, although the porch and siding were altered in the 1990s when the turned posts, balustrade, and shingles were added to the front. The west and east facades retain their original siding and some original windows. The rear addition was added between 1888 and 1896; changes older than 50 years may be significant in their own right. In the 1990s, the roof style of the rear addition was changed and a small rear porch was added. The chimney was also removed and a foundation was added.

Mr. McClintock reviewed the location of the home near Ursich Park, Old Town Park, Slavonian Hall, and Seaman's Rest. He noted its appearance on the 1896 Sandborn Maps as part of a group of five small houses. He reviewed bird's eye view maps where detailed imaging from the 1884 illustration revealed the row of five houses as well. He commented that the houses were in existence at least until 1883 based on the map. He reviewed the 1869 plat of the City from Mortan McCarver which included the house being discussed. He reviewed a picture of Tacoma from 1870 which included the Steele Hotel and Joe Carr's cabin. A 1907 picture was the earliest photograph from that area to include the house. Mr. McClintock reviewed a list of the residents of the home from 1895 to 1986, noting that the occupants were typically working class people who worked in the various industries on the waterfront in Old Town. He compared an inventory photograph from 1977 and a current photo noting that there was now a new foundation, more steps, the balustrade had been replaced, a turn post had been installed, and decorative shingles had been added to the gable. He noted the presence of the original window on the front and on the east façade. He noted that the west façade retained the original channel siding. He reported that there used to be a shed roof on the back, but now had a pitched roof.

Carol Goforth, the property owner, thanked Mr. McClintock for his research.

There was a motion.

"I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission adopt the analysis as findings and schedule the 2312 North 29th Street nomination for a public hearing and future consideration at meeting on June 28, 2017."

Motion: House

Second: Thorne

The motion was approved unanimously.

B. 2804-2806 McCarver Street, Beals House Duplex

Ms. Hoogkamer read the staff report.

BACKGROUND

The Beals House Duplex, at 2804-2806 McCarver Street, was built in 1888. The house was built by Curtis A. Beals, a contractor and real estate salesman who also served two terms on the Tacoma City Council. Beals lost the house in the 1890s; for the next five decades the house was occupied by members of Old Town's Croatian immigrant community. In 1984, Eckart Klee, the home's current owner and resident, purchased the building. The building is nominated under Criterion A for its association with the development of Old Town and its Croatian community; Criterion B for its association with Curtis A. Beals and members of the Croatian immigrant community; and Criterion C as an example of the West Coast stick style, representing a transition between the Italianate style and emerging Queen-Anne, Stick, Shingle, and Neo-Colonial styles.

The property is nominated under the following criteria:

- A. *Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or*
- B. *Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or*
- C. *Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction;*

Staff recommends removing Criterion B as that association is also included under Criterion A.

REQUESTED ACTION

Determination of whether the property nominated to the Tacoma Register of Historic Places appears to meet the threshold criteria for nomination, and if so, scheduling the nominations for public hearing. The commission may forward all or part of the nomination for future consideration.

EFFECTS OF NOMINATION

- Future changes to the exterior will require approval of the Landmarks Preservation Commission prior to those changes being made, to ensure historical and architectural appropriateness.
- Unnecessary demolition of properties listed on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places is strongly discouraged by the municipal code, and requires approval of the Landmarks Preservation Commission.
- Future renovations of listed on the Tacoma Register of Historic Places may qualify for the Special Tax Valuation property tax incentive.
- The property will become eligible for the Historic Conditional Use Permit.

STANDARDS

The threshold criteria for Tacoma Register listing are listed at 13.07.040B(1), and include:

1. Property is at least 50 years old at the time of nomination; and,
2. The property retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association such that it is able to convey its historical, cultural, or architectural significance.

ANALYSIS

1. At 129-years-old the property meets the age threshold criterion.
2. The property retains its integrity, including its original massing, scale, design and most materials; however, in 1984, a small addition was added to the south side of the house and all of the original windows were replaced with aluminum sashes, although the framing is still intact. The cast iron balustrade that was on the roof has also been lost.

Mr. McClintock reviewed Sandborn Fire Insurance Maps from 1888 and 1896 which included the Beals House. He

noted the presence of a smaller house and a stream bed nearby shown on the map. He reviewed a photo taken from the ridge above Old Town in the 1890s, noting a sheer drop-off near a house, a trestle style bridge, many worker houses, and smokestacks along the waterfront. He discussed a 1977 inventory photo of the house, noting that it had been vacant for 20-30 years at the time of the photo. He commented that when the current owner of the home took ownership in 1984 there had been much work to do. Contemporary photos were reviewed. Mr. McClintock noted the addition of a small shed roof that connected the two wings and enclosed the space. He commented that the addition had been constructed when the new foundation had been put in. He noted the home was in the West Coast Stick Style, which Tacoma had very few examples of in the duplex style. He noted the presence of original doors, transom lights, a restored balustrade on the top of the porch roof, original porch columns, and an original balustrade that separated two parts of the porch. He noted Stick Style ornamentations including decorative brackets along the porch. He noted that the windows had been replaced in a way that did not alter the external framing. On the south side of the house Mr. McClintock noted a non-contributing addition. On the back of the house, he noted a lower level entrance to an added living space and an enclosed porch.

Commissioner Schloesser asked if the two wings were contributing. Mr. McClintock confirmed that they were but not the side wing.

Mr. Klee, the owner of the home, commented that the two wings were original to the building and were where the kitchens were located when the building was originally constructed as a duplex. He discussed the state of the home when it was purchased in 1984. He discussed how an antique flush tank from the building was donated to Meeker Mansion.

Ms. Ursich commented that she thought the duplex deserved to be saved and she had seen it all her life. She discussed the original residents Curtis and Georgianna Beals who had lived there for a long time. She discussed her grandfather Joseph who lived in one duplex while his cousins lived in the adjoining duplex. She discussed a picture of her grandfather in front of the Slavonian Lodge, commenting how the Croats formed the lodge and how it gave them a sense of community in Old Town. She reviewed a photo of her grandmother and grandfather's wedding photo from 1908 and a photo of her grandfather with his fishing crew. She discussed Anton Jurun who was a resident of the duplex in 1976. She commented that the home should be saved because it was part of history.

Commissioner Johnson commented that the Old Town history had been largely forgotten and that it was the roots of the Tacoma area.

Chair Pratt noted that the property was nominated under criteria A, B, and C while staff was recommending A and C.

There was a motion.

"I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission adopt the analysis as findings and schedule the Beals House Duplex nomination for a public hearing and future consideration at the June 28, 2017 meeting under criteria A and C."

Motion: Johnson

Second: Thorne

The motion was approved unanimously.

4. DESIGN REVIEW

A. Convention Center Hotel (Union Station Conservation District)

Ms. Hoogkamer read the staff report.

BACKGROUND

On September 14, 2016, the Landmarks Preservation Commission issued design approval for Phase 1 of the Convention Center Hotel. The Commission deferred approval of the dichroic glass panels until more visual examples could be provided and recommended that the window sills on the brick façade be precast concrete instead of metal and that the brick façade elements continue around the corner of the building nearest to the Convention Center. The Commission also approved the demolition of the existing non-historic garage structure, adjacent to the Carlton Center.

In response to the Commission's comments, the glass fins and dichroic glass have been removed from the design. Additional changes have also been made to accommodate cost adjustments, egress requirements, and the hotel's overall program. The Commission was briefed on these changes on March 8, 2017. The project team is now seeking approval for the final design. Updated elevations are included in the packet.

ACTION REQUESTED

Approval of the above scope of work.

STANDARDS

Design Guidelines for the Union Depot/Warehouse District & the Union Station Conservation District included in the packet.

ANALYSIS

1. This property is in the Union Station Conservation District and, as such, new construction is subject to review by the Landmarks Preservation Commission pursuant to TMC 13.05.047.
2. The Landmarks Preservation Commission may, at its discretion, waive mandatory requirements imposed by the design guidelines. In determining whether a waiver is appropriate, the Landmarks Preservation Commission shall require an applicant to demonstrate by clear and convincing evidence that, because of special circumstances not generally applicable to other property or facilities, including size, shape, design, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of those mandatory requirements would be unnecessary to further the purposes of this chapter.
3. The Landmarks Preservation Commission issued preliminary approval for the height and massing on April 22, 2015.
4. The Landmarks Preservation Commission issued design approval on September 14, 2016.
5. The proposed materials reflect the prominent materials in the district, which include brick and metallic finishes.
6. The proposed building colors and materials complement both the historic and new elements of the district.
7. The project is subject to a development agreement with the City, which requires that performance milestones and financial ability are demonstrated prior to conveyance of the property.

Jason Lamb, Ankrom Moisan Architects, reviewed that at the previous presentation one of the main concerns had been the junction between the podium and the Carlton building which had previously been a large bay of metal panels. He reported that they had increased the bay of the portion that spanned between the two volumes leaving very little left over for transition space. They would be using a cast stone material for the transition area that would tie with the base of Carlton building. He noted that the base of the Carlton building had been painted over so a perfect match would not be possible, but they would be close. Commissioner Williams asked if the stones would be set in a brick pattern with the joints lined up as they appeared in the illustration. Commissioner Schloesser commented that it would be more appropriate to have the stones match the brick pattern. Mr. Lamb also noted that they had enhanced the cornice line to make it thicker and project further at the request of the client.

Mr. Lamb reviewed there had been concern about the composition of the façade at the end of Broadway, commenting that there would be another building to the left eventually so the composition was focusing on how it would look in the longer term. For the new design they were tying in some lines from the Carlton building. The brick section would be flanked by CMU on both sides. The main entry to the hotel garage would be at the bottom.

Regarding the concerns from the previous meetings about how the North Façade was experienced, Mr. Lamb reviewed a perspective rendering. He noted that the north side would be in the shade for most of the year. He reviewed the materials that would be used and noted that the top would line up.

There was a motion.

"I move the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the application for the Tacoma Convention Center Hotel as submitted with the change of the running bond on the cast stone connection."

Motion: Williams

Second: Schloesser

The motion was approved unanimously.

B. 1701 Pacific Avenue, Tacoma Art Museum (Union Station Conservation District)

Ms. Hoogkamer read the staff report.

BACKGROUND

The Tacoma Art Museum is seeking approval for a new addition on the north end of the existing 71,921sf building. The new 6,860sf addition will house the Benaroya collection and tell the story of the studio glass art movement. The addition will also have a glass enclosure that looks out to the Prairie Line Trail. The exterior material of the addition will match the existing structure. The addition will be 84'-7.25," while the existing structure is 103'-6." Pursuant to TMC 13.05.047 design review is required for additions to existing buildings within the Union Station Conservation District. The Commission was briefed on this proposal on March 22, 2017. The project team will address the Commission's comments on the view of the Murray Morgan Bridge and the alignment of the addition with the existing structure.

ACTION REQUESTED

Approval of the above scope of work.

STANDARDS

Design Guidelines for the Union Depot/Warehouse District & the Union Station Conservation District

Included in the packet.

ANALYSIS

1. This property is in the Union Station Conservation District and, as such, new construction is subject to review by the Landmarks Preservation Commission pursuant to TMC 13.05.047.
2. The Landmarks Preservation Commission may, at its discretion, waive mandatory requirements imposed by the design guidelines. In determining whether a waiver is appropriate, the Landmarks Preservation Commission shall require an applicant to demonstrate by clear and convincing evidence that, because of special circumstances not generally applicable to other property or facilities, including size, shape, design, topography, location, or surroundings, the strict application of those mandatory requirements would be unnecessary to further the purposes of this chapter.
3. The addition is under the 85' height limit and compatible with the scale, color, and materials of the existing building.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the application.

Commissioner Williams recused himself from the item.

Dave Bonewitz, Olson Kundig, reviewed comments from the previous meeting which had included comments about the orientation of the existing window towards the Murray Morgan Bridge; changing the orientation towards the Prairie Line Trail; and the alignment of the addition.

Kimberly Shoemake-Medlock, Olson Kundig, reviewed a map of the area noting the viewing angle of the existing window and the view from the proposed addition. She commented that they had taken a close look at the view that they would be cutting off to the Murray Morgan bridge and concluded that from the addition the exit ramp would obstruct that view. They wanted to turn the view towards the Prairie Line Trail and the City. She reviewed a map of the addition relative to the trail, adding that they were considering wrapping the window to capture north and south views as well.

Mr. Bonewitz reviewed a map of the addition, discussing how there was no effective outward view except towards the freeway, so they would shift the view towards the Prairie Line Trail and would have a stronger dialogue with the vista gallery and events along the trail.

Ms. Shoemake-Medlock discussed the alignment of the addition to the existing museum. They intended to continue the metal panel pattern on the west façade of the new addition. They would also continue the concrete along the base of the building. She commented that the pattern of the concrete would align with the ribbon window and the gallery floor level of the addition. Mr. Bonewitz reported that they would be covering the section of the window that turns the corner with the addition. He commented that they felt it was not appropriate to continue the window through the addition.

There was a motion.

"I move that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the application for 1701 Pacific Avenue, Tacoma Art Museum, as submitted."

Motion: House

Second: Flowers
The motion was approved unanimously.

5. BOARD BRIEFINGS

A. 2114 Pacific Avenue (Union Depot/Warehouse Historic District)

Ms. Hoogkamer read the staff report.

BACKGROUND

The applicant is proposing a new three-level parking garage on the site which is currently a parking lot. The project would include adding four windows to the south wall of 2114 Pacific Avenue, which is a noncontributing building in the Union Depot/Warehouse Historic District. A green roof, decking, and a new metal storefront would also be added to this building. Alterations to noncontributing builds are exempt from design review. The new garage will include new retail storefronts along Pacific Avenue, which will be used for ADA parking until the Brewery Block project is completed. The proposed materials include brick, concrete, and Corten steel mesh and panels. The Commerce side will include ramps to the second and third floor parking decks.

Mike Bartlett, Hunt Mottet Partners LLC, commented that in tearing down damaged buildings and leasing up office space for another project they had discovered that they have a severe parking issue. He commented that their current project would give them surplus parking initially but they had already received interest from other businesses in utilizing the remaining spaces. He commented that additional parking would allow office workers to be closer to their workplace and allow loft tenants to have more direct access to parking. He commented that true multi-level structure parking wouldn't be financially feasible, but their proposal allowed them to have enough open ventilation to qualify as an open garage so they wouldn't have to include sprinklers or ventilation. He commented that they were building 40,000 feet of commercial space so they didn't anticipate needing any additional space. Mr. Bartlett commented that the bottom floor, which is where retail space would ordinarily go, would be where the handicapped stalls were located. He reported that they were considering merging some of the parcels into one. Mr. Bartlett noted that what they were proposing for the street was 80% storefront and that they needed parking somewhere.

Mr. Bartlett discussed the design which would leave structural members exposed for an industrial look befitting the history of the area. It would have laser cut railings with a rusted metal look at the top of the Pacific Avenue Elevation. He commented that they saw the roof as a possible event space as it was a 10,000 square foot open area. Mr. Bartlett reported that they were going to make the street more pedestrian friendly with their design including landscaping and stamped cobblestone. Michael Sullivan noted that the location was the southern edge of the historic district and the historic businesses would have had a more industrial framework character. He added that a huge section of the neighborhood would be involved in some pretty dramatic changes with big buildings coming in and the existing surface parking lots would be new construction so they needed a place to move the cars while they do the construction. He commented that they wanted to fit into the character of the historic district. He commented that Corten steel would not look cheap, noting that the Corten Steel in the Alber's Mill's addition had weathered nicely.

Mr. Bartlett noted that the construction would be simple so it would be developed earlier than the other projects. Commissioner Williams asked if the parking garage was a placeholder and if they had other plans for the future. Mr. Bartlett responded that he had no plans to change it to something else for the foreseeable future but the garage was designed to allow several floors of light framing above it.

Commissioner Flowers asked if there had been a parking or circulation study on how the egress along Pacific Ave would affect the surrounding facilities or current traffic patterns. Mr. Bartlett responded that they had not conducted a study, but it would only be 110 spaces. It was noted that on the Pacific Avenue side the number of parking spots would not change much compared to the existing parking lot. He added that there would not be a ramp inside the structure.

Commissioner Johnson asked if the cars would be visible through the lattice of laser cut steel on Pacific Avenue. Mr. Bartlett responded that they had not determined the final design but they might need to put something up on the lower level. He added that if they put something up, they might not be able to put in glazing. Discussion ensued. Commissioner Thorne asked if the exit would have a rolling door. Mr. Bartlett responded that it could have one, but they were not sure how much they wanted to secure the garage.

Chair Pratt asked if the mesh panels were being used so that the structure would qualify as open air. Mr. Bartlett confirmed that they were. Chair Pratt reviewed that the design guidelines encouraged the use of masonry for the construction of infill buildings, adding that continuing the brick storefront element across the whole building would look nice. Mr. Bartlett responded that the sprinkler and mechanical requirements would make that unfeasible. Mr. Sullivan commented that they wanted it to look like an industrial parking area so that pedestrians would expect cars to be crossing.

Commissioner Williams commented that he would like to see the bracing element go behind or be the same color as the Corten Steel. He commented that he preferred to see it behind the steel panels and mimicked in each one of the bays. Chair Pratt suggested that they carry the horizontal lines across. Discussion ensued.

Commissioner Williams suggested that as they explore designs for the railing on the roof deck, less was more. He added that the current design was very busy.

Commissioner House commented that it would be more in keeping with the guidelines to have masonry on the Pacific Side instead of the decorative metal element.

Mr. Sullivan noted that the adjacent four story building would receive a top floor remodel and get a green roof. He noted that two windows in the side would be converted to doors.

Chair Pratt expressed concern that the guidelines required masonry and storefronts all of the way through.

6. PRESERVATION PLANNING/BOARD BUSINESS

A. Events and Activities Update

Mr. Hoogkamer provided an update on the following events and activities:

2017 Events

1. Historic Preservation Month (May)
 - i) Amazing Preservation Race Recap
 - ii) Puyallup Tribe Reservation Tour Recap
 - iii) Historic Preservation Awards and Maritime History Walking Tour Recap
 - iv) Cycles on the Foss: Environmental History Bike Tour (5pm @ Foss Waterway Seaport, May 26th)
2. Northeast Tacoma Tour (12pm @ Dash Point Elementary, June 3rd)
3. Eyes of the Totem 90th Anniversary (June 9th and 10th)
4. Washington Trust for Historic Preservation Youth Heritage Program: Maritime Heritage (July 11th – 15th)
5. South Tacoma Walking Tour (10am TBD, August 12th)
6. Walking Tour (10am TBD, September 9th)
7. Social Justice Bus Tour (TBD September 30th)
8. Prairie Line Trail Arts Symposium (October 19th TBD)
9. Fourth Annual Holiday Heritage Dance (Tour: 5pm; Dance: 6-9pm @ Browns Point Improvement Club, November 3rd)

Ms. Hoogkamer noted that she had distributed the report and decision on the Scottish Rite temple demolition which included the recommendations for mitigation from the Historic Preservation Office.

7. CHAIR COMMENTS

There were no comments from the Chair.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:28 p.m.